

# **Report of the Stakeholder Consultation for Retroactive Accreditation under the Gold Standard of the Hebei Chengde Songshan Windfarm Project**

## 1. Meeting Background

Hebei Chengde Songshan Wind farm Project was registered as a CDM project (reference number 0877) on 8 April 2007 after the approval from the host country and EB. The participants of the CDM project are Hebei Hong-Song Wind Power Share Holding Ltd., Carbon Resource Management Ltd. (CRM), Essent Energy Trading BV, and Essent Trading International SA.

The project is developed as a Gold Standard (GS) CDM Project. As the project has already been put into operation, the retroactive registration procedure of the *"Gold Standard Manual for CDM Developers"* is followed, including the organisation of a Stakeholder Consultation.

## 2. Meeting Contents

### 2.1 Meeting Notice and Invitation

- a) A meeting notice was posted on the gate of the Wind farm and the residential area on 8 April 2008.
- b) A meeting notice was posted on the website of CRM, <http://www.carbonresource.com/news.html#k>.
- c) Written invitation to the governmental offices, NGOs.
- d) Written invitation to the GS NGO supporters.

### 2.2 Date and Venue of the Meeting

Date: 18 April 2008

Venue: 3rd Floor Assembly Room, Weichang Hotel, Weichang County

### 2.3 Meeting Participants

The following persons attended the meeting:

Name	Organization	Function
Mr.Zhang Chunguo	Hebei Hong-Song Wind Power Share Holding Ltd.	Project owner representative
Mr.He Zhiyuan	Hebei Hong-Song Wind Power Share Holding Ltd.	
Mr.Xie Xiaobing	CRM	CDM developer representative
Ms.Li Ning	CRM	
Mr.Yang Guohua	Weichang County Government	Local policy maker
Mr.Wang Xingmin	Development and Reform Commission, Weichang County	
Mr.Yin Yunjun	Bureau of Environmental Protection, Weichang County	
Mr.Lv Chenguang	Bureau of Land and resource, Weichang County	
Mr.Qu Yanqiu	Hongsongwa Nature Reserve	
Ms.Li Dan	The Renewable Energy & Energy Efficiency Partnership (REEEP)	GS NGO supporter
Mr.Dong Yinghua	Hongsongwa Pasture	Local villagers directly impacted by the project
Mr.Du Jun	Weichang County	
Mr.Li Yan	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Mr.Liu Weijun	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Ms.Wang Jianru	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Ms.Yu Benshu	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Mr.Gao Lei	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Mr.Wang Lei	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Mr.Li Weiqi	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Mr.Yu Haisheng	Hongsongwa Pasture	

Mr.Wang Lihui	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Ms.Xu Huijuan	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Ms.Xiao Guihua	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Mr.Wang Chao	Weichang County	
Mr.Du Jinda	Hongsongwa Pasture	
Mr.Wei Qinghao	Hongsongwa Pasture	

## 2.4 Meeting Language

Mandarin (local language).

## 2.5 Meeting Procedure

- a) Distribute the agenda, questionnaires and other introduction documents.
- b) Introduce the participants and meeting purpose, the operation condition of the project, impacts on the environment and residents by Vice Manager Mr. Zhang Chunguo from Hebei Hong-Song.
- c) CDM, GS and GS Retroactive Registration introduction by Mr. Xie Xiaobing from CRM.
- d) Give the key information about REEEP and the opinions on the sustainable development of the project by Ms. Li Dan from REEEP.
- e) Discussions.
- f) Questions and answers.
- g) Completion of questionnaires.

## 2.6 Meeting Summary

b) The Vice Manager, Mr. Zhang Chunguo, introduced the participants and meeting purpose, the operation condition of the project, impacts on the environment and residents. He explained that the project adopted effective environmental protection measures to reduce negative effects during the construction and operation period. Wind power is a clean energy source, which will help to reduce fossil fuel consumption and emissions of waste

gases. Meanwhile, the project provides job opportunities and increases local tax revenues, which can bring in good social and environmental benefits.

c) Mr. Xie Xiaobing from CRM introduced background information about the CDM, GS and GS Retroactive Accreditation. He also described the assessment process and results of the indicators of sustainable development matrix for the project.

d) Ms. Li Dan from REEEP made a brief introduction of REEEP to the meeting participants. She explained that there is little pollution or negative impact from the project during the construction period due to effective protection measures. She supports the project as a powerful driving force for sustainable development of the society: Gold Wind equipment was used by this project, manufactured in China; the project helps technological development; and the project has gained support from many sides, assisting the smooth introduction and operation of the project.

e/f) Questions and answers:

Question 1 (Local resident) Does the project have a negative impact on the ecosystem?

Answer (Developer) The construction period was not long, and environmental protection measures and an efficient construction arrangement had been adopted to minimise the impact. The environmental experts had already been invited to the project site to make a verification of the vegetation recovery when the project put into operation, the result was there is no negative impact on the ecosystem.

Question 2 (Local resident) Does the project produce waste?

Answer (Developer) The project takes advantage of the wind resource without generating waste water. Solid waste is removed to a landfill site.

Question 3 (Local resident) Does the project produce noise and nuclear waste?

Answer (Developer) Noise is produced by the wind turbines, but the

level is lower than the local noise standard. The project does not produce dust during operation nor radiation. The project site is far from the residential areas.

Question 4 (CRM) Has the wind farm had a negative impact on the propagation in the nature reserve?

Answer (YanQiu Qu, Hongsongwa natural protection zoon) Both birds and other animals generally live near the water in the low-lying areas. The wind turbines are situated in much higher areas. In addition, the project site is far from the core area of the nature reserve. Therefore, there is no negative impact on the propagation in the nature reserve.

Question 5 (CRM) Were any workers injured during the construction period?

Answer (Developer) There were no workers injured during the construction period as the project had adopted safety protection measures.

Question 6 (CRM) Do the turbines work well?

Answer (Developer) The wind turbines work well at safe and stable operation levels with no accidents since the project has been put into operation at the end of 2006.

Question 7 (CRM) Do the turbines spoil the view or disturb Geomancy (Fengshui)?

Answer (Local resident representative) No.

Question 8 (CRM) Does the wind farm change the local living standard, and what benefit are there to the local area?

Answer (Local resident representative) The project has benefited transport and electricity supply. There are now more shops and hotels, which have brought more advantage to the local economy. Before, when there was no wind farm, there was no road, and water and electricity utilization was not convenient. For building the wind farm, a new road was built, and telephones and electricity can be used now. Also, more local residents have bought a tractor to transport materials needed by the wind farm.

(Quqiuyan, Hongsongwa Natural protection zoon) During the construction period work opportunities to local people were provided for the underground cable laying.

(Government representative) While there are mostly overhead power lines around Inner Mongolia, the lines for this wind farm were buried underground. Also the ecological recovery was carried out well.

Question 9 (CRM) Have you attended a meeting like this before?

Answer (Local resident representative) A questionnaire/survey was done by the wind farm developer in 2006.

Question 10 (CRM) Was there any opinion with regards to developing this project as CDM project?

Answer (Local resident representative) We all supported the wind farm as a CDM project, which had brought benefit to local area.  
(Government representative) China has ratified the Kyoto Protocol and can develop CDM projects. The proposed project has changed the local environment and the quality of the atmosphere, while, at present, fossil fuels contribute the majority of energy consumption. Europe country and Japan are quite active to develop CDM projects. These projects have changed the power sector structure and improve enterprise energy structure. CDM has improved enterprise income and revenue per kWh. Meanwhile, local government revenue has also increased.

Question 11 (Local resident representative) What are the main points for GS?

Answer (CRM) Additionality and sustainable development, which means environmentally, socially, and economically and technologically sustainable.

Further remarks:

(Developer) The CDM helps bring advanced technology from an industrialised to a developing country. CO2 emission reduction targets [in industrialised

countries] can be met through buying CERs [from developing country projects], which will bring benefits to both sides. A GS CDM project is better than a 'normal' CDM project, which will bring more benefits to the project. This meeting is held to receive feedback and hear opinions from all stakeholders.

(Yanqiu Qu, Hongsong natural protection area) We welcome and support the development of CDM projects. Wind power is a kind of renewable energy, which is part of the solution to global climate change. However, the investment in wind project is higher than conventional energy projects and the benefit are low. Without CDM support, this project would not be carried out. We support this project as CDM and GS.

(Government representative) Thank you for your support. As a pioneer of wind power development, Hong-Song Wind Power Ltd. has built and operated the first wind project in Weichang County, which has benefited the local wind power industry, economy and tourism etc., and which has also given a great contribution to local tax revenues. The relation between industrial development and environmental protection has been a concern for the government. But the sightseeing has become better than before, and the project benefits local residents. During construction and operation period, project owner was concerned about local environmental protection. We support GS development.

g) All stakeholder questionnaires were completed and collected. In total 22 questionnaires.

A CRM representative asked all the participants whether there are any further questions or issues needing clarification. CRM explained that the notes of this meeting will be made available and that related documents can be obtained from the project owner. Finally, all participants were thanked for their presence and opinions.

### 3. Questionnaire result

### 3.1 Participants

Base situation		Number	Percentage
sex	Male	17	77.3%
	Female	5	22.7%
age	20-29	9	40.9%
	30-39	6	27.3%
	Above 40	7	31.8%
Education	Under junior high school	9	40.9%
	Senior high school	8	36.4%
	University	5	22.7%

### 3.2 Investigation results

- (a) 68.2% participants knew this project.  
31.8% participants knew this project quite well.
- (b) 77.3% participants did not believe the project would have negative effects on the local environment.  
Among those thought it would:
- 4.5% thought noise would disturb local environment.
  - 4.5% thought wild animals would be disturbed.
  - 9.1% thought birds would be disturbed.
  - 100% do not believe the project would bring big negative impact on local environment.
- (c) 100% participants thought the project owner had carried out construction, operation and maintenance in a safe, efficient and clean manner.
- (d) 100% participants believe the project has benefited the local economy:
- 59.1% thought it had brought more work opportunities during construction period.
  - 54.5% thought it had brought more work opportunities during

operation period.

- 72.7% thought it had reduced local electricity shortage.
  - 40.9% thought it had reduced environment pollution.
  - 72.7% thought it had benefited local tourism development, increased tax income, and improved the economy.
  - 68.2% thought it had reduced poverty.
  - 13.6% mentioned increased land utilisation, optimised grid structure, and increased local revenues, respectively.
- (e) Among those who think the project will change the local living standard:
- 68.2% thought it had increase income.
  - 63.6% thought it had brought more guarantee to use electricity.
  - 40.9% thought it had improved traffic situation.
  - 31.8% thought it had improved air quality.
  - 63.6% thought it had increased work opportunities.
  - 59.1% thought it had improved life quality.
- (f) 100% participants thought this project had brought positive change.
- (g) 100% participants agreed to project construction.

#### 4. Further feedback

Based on the discussions during the meeting the project developer has given further feedback to several issues:

Among the feedback mentioning negative impacts (noise 4.5%, impact on wild animals 4.5%, impact on birds 9.1%), none thought the project had brought huge serious negative impact.

The project owner aimed to reduce the impact of the project by shortening the construction period, limiting the construction time, keeping long distance to residents' houses. Therefore, the noise will not bring bit impact on local residents.

Though there is noise during operation, the wind turbines are installed in a highland area, in a dispersed arrangement. The background noise is high, so

the project noise does not increase the local noise and does not disturb local animal life. Also, the wind farm was far from residential areas and turbine operation noise does not disturb local residents.

The construction period at specific construction points lasted only 1-2 months. There is a long distance between every construction point, so there was no connected grass area and no big impact on plant environment connectedness. Therefore, the project construction has very little impact on animals.

The elevation where the wind turbines are installed is higher than that where bird activity is taking place, so there was no impact on birds in the natural protection area.

All the participants at the meeting gave a positive assessment on the environment, social and sustainable impacts of the project. Also, the participants thought the project owner provided a good construction and operation-maintenance environment. The participants supported the project construction and had no serious dissenting opinions.

For any further questions, opinions and suggestions, please contact:

Zhiyuan He, tel: 0314-878 3621, Email: onelook1982@sina.com

Li Ning, tel: 010-8447 5246, Email: ln@carbonresource.com